

SARAH E. HARRINGTON  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

STEPHANIE M. HINDS (CABN 154284)  
Acting United States Attorney

SARA WINSLOW (DCBN 457643)  
Chief, Civil Division

BENJAMIN WOLINSKY (CABN 305410)  
SHIWON CHOE (CABN 320041)  
Assistant United States Attorneys

450 Golden Gate Avenue, Box 36055  
San Francisco, California 94102-3495  
Telephone: (415) 436-7200  
Facsimile: (415) 436-6748  
benjamin.wolinsky@usdoj.gov  
shiwon.choe@usdoj.gov

JAMIE ANN YAVELBERG  
PATRICIA L. HANOWER  
ARTHUR S. DI DIO  
GARY R. DYAL  
LAURIE A. OBEREMBT  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division  
Commercial Litigation Branch

Attorneys for the United States of America

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel.  
RONDA OSINEK,

Plaintiff,

v.

KAISER PERMANENTE,

Defendant.

) Case No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC

) **UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO**  
) **INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO**  
) **INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER**  
) **TO UNSEAL**

) **FILED UNDER SEAL**

(captions continued on next page)

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel.  
NASER AREFI, AJITH KUMAR, and PRIME  
HEALTHCARE SERVICES,

Plaintiffs,

v.

KAISER FOUNDATION HEALTH PLAN,  
INC., et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:16-cv-01558-EMC

**UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO  
INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO  
INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER  
TO UNSEAL**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel.  
MARCIA STEIN AND RODOLFO BONE,

Plaintiffs,

v.

KAISER FOUNDATION HEALTH PLAN,  
INC., et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:16-cv-05337-EMC

**UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO  
INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO  
INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER  
TO UNSEAL**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and STATE  
OF CALIFORNIA ex rel. GLORYANNE  
BRYANT and VICTORIA M. HERNANDEZ,

Plaintiffs,

v.

KAISER PERMANENTE, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:18-cv-01347-EMC

**UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO  
INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO  
INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER  
TO UNSEAL**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

(captions continued on next page)

1 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and STATE )  
2 OF CALIFORNIA ex rel. MICHAEL )  
3 BICOCCA, )  
4 Plaintiff, )  
5 v. )  
6 PERMANENTE MEDICAL GROUP, INC., et )  
7 al., )  
8 Defendants. )

---

Case No. 3:21-cv-03124-EMC

**UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO  
INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO  
INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER  
TO UNSEAL**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

8 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA ex rel. )  
9 JAMES M. TAYLOR, )  
10 Plaintiff, )  
11 v. )  
12 KAISER PERMANENTE, INC., et al., )  
13 Defendants. )

---

Case No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC

**UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO  
INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO  
INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER  
TO UNSEAL**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

1 Pursuant to the False Claims Act, 31 U.S.C. § 3730(b)(2) and (4), the United States  
 2 notifies the Court that it hereby intervenes in part and declines to intervene in part in the above-  
 3 captioned consolidated *qui tam* actions. Specifically, the United States intervenes on the allegations that  
 4 defendants Kaiser Permanente; Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.; Kaiser Foundation Health Plan of  
 5 Colorado; The Permanente Medical Group, Inc.; Southern California Permanente Medical Group, Inc.;  
 6 and Colorado Permanente Medical Group, P.C.; submitted, or caused to be submitted, false claims for  
 7 risk-adjustment payments based on diagnoses improperly added via addenda under Medicare Part C  
 8 from the years 2009 until present. The United States declines to intervene on all other allegations. The  
 9 United States will file and serve its consolidated complaint within 90 days (i.e., by October 25, 2021), as  
 10 provided for in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 4(m).

11 2. The United States requests that the following be unsealed:

- 12 a. the Complaint filed on August 22, 2013, by the relator in *United States ex rel.*  
 13 *Osinek v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- 14 b. the Complaint filed on September 4, 2015, by the relators in *United States ex rel.*  
 15 *Arefi v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-01558-EMC (N.D.  
 16 Cal.);
- 17 c. the Complaint filed on May 16, 2016, by the relators in *United States ex rel. Stein*  
 18 *v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-05337-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- 19 d. the First Amended Complaint filed on November 3, 2016, by the relators in  
 20 *United States ex rel. Stein v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-  
 21 05337-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- 22 e. the Complaint filed on March 1, 2018, by the relators in *United States ex rel.*  
 23 *Bryant v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:18-cv-01347-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- 24 f. the Complaint filed on February 10, 2020, by the relator in *United States ex rel.*  
 25 *Bicocca v. Permanente Medical Group, Inc.*, No. 3:21-cv-03124-EMC (N.D.  
 26 Cal.);
- 27 g. the First Amended Complaint filed on October 9, 2020, by the relator in *United*  
 28 *States ex rel. Bicocca v. Permanente Medical Group, Inc.*, No. 3:21-cv-03124-

1 EMC (N.D. Cal.);

2 h. the Complaint filed on October 22, 2014, by the relator in *United States ex rel.*  
3 *Taylor v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC (N.D. Cal.);

4 i. the First Amended Complaint filed on November 3, 2014, by the relator in *United*  
5 *States ex rel. Taylor v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC (N.D. Cal.);

6 j. the United States' Motion to Consolidate Cases filed on June 11, 2021;

7 k. the Order Granting the United States' Motion to Consolidate Cases filed on June  
8 25, 2021;

9 l. this Notice of Election to Intervene in Part and to Decline to Intervene in Part, and  
10 accompanying order; and

11 m. all future filings in this action.

12 All other contents of the Court's files in these matters (including, but not limited to, any applications  
13 filed by the United States for an extension of the investigative period under 31 U.S.C. § 3130(b)(3) or  
14 for any other reason) should remain under seal (and not placed on the public docket) and not be served  
15 upon the defendants.

16 3. Although the United States declines to intervene in a portion of these consolidated  
17 actions, we respectfully refer the Court to 31 U.S.C. § 3730(b)(1), which allows a relator to maintain the  
18 declined portion of an action in the name of the United States; providing, however, that the "action may  
19 be dismissed only if the court and the Attorney General give written consent to the dismissal and their  
20 reasons for consenting." The United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit has held that,  
21 notwithstanding this language, the United States only has the right to a hearing when it objects to a  
22 settlement or dismissal of the action. *United States ex rel. Green v. Northrop Corp.*, 59 F.3d 953, 959  
23 (9th Cir. 1995); *United States ex rel. Killingsworth v. Northrop Corp.*, 25 F.3d 715, 723–25 (9th Cir.  
24 1994). Therefore, the United States requests that, should either a relator or a defendant propose that the  
25 portion of these actions in which the United States has not intervened be dismissed, settled, or otherwise  
26 discontinued, this Court provide the United States with notice and an opportunity to be heard before  
27 ruling or granting its approval.

28 4. Furthermore, pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3730(c)(3), the United States requests that all

pleadings filed in this action, even as to the non-intervened portion of these actions, be served upon the United States. The United States also requests that all orders issued by the Court be sent to the government's counsel. The United States reserves its right to order any deposition transcripts and to intervene in the portion of these actions in which it is declining to intervene today, for good cause, at a later date. The United States reserves the right to seek the dismissal of any relator's action or claim on any appropriate grounds, including under 31 U.S.C. §§ 3730(b)(5) and (e)(4).

5. The United States requests that the initial case management conference be set at least one month after October 25, 2021, so that the parties may have adequate time to confer after the United States' complaint is filed and served, and prior to the conference.

DATED: July 27, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

SARAH E. HARRINGTON  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

STEPHANIE M. HINDS  
Acting United States Attorney

/s/ Benjamin J. Wolinsky  
BENJAMIN WOLINSKY  
SHIWON CHOE  
Assistant United States Attorneys

JAMIE ANN YAVELBERG  
PATRICIA L. HANOWER  
ARTHUR S. DI DIO  
GARY R. DYAL  
LAURIE A. OBEREMBT  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division  
Commercial Litigation Branch

Attorneys for the United States of America

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

The Court, having considered the United States' Notice of Election to Intervene in Part and to Decline to Intervene in Part, hereby orders that:

1. All current contents of the Court's files in these consolidated actions shall remain under seal (and not placed on the public docket) and not be served upon Defendants, except for:

- a. the Complaint filed on August 22, 2013, by the relator in *United States ex rel. Osinek v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:13-cv-03891-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- b. the Complaint filed on September 4, 2015, by the relators in *United States ex rel. Arefi v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-01558-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- c. the Complaint filed on May 16, 2016, by the relators in *United States ex rel. Stein v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-05337-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- d. the First Amended Complaint filed on November 3, 2016, by the relators in *United States ex rel. Stein v. Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.*, No. 3:16-cv-05337-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- e. the Complaint filed on March 1, 2018, by the relators in *United States ex rel. Bryant v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:18-cv-01347-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- f. the Complaint filed on February 10, 2020, by the relator in *United States ex rel. Bicocca v. Permanente Medical Group, Inc.*, No. 3:21-cv-03124-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- g. the First Amended Complaint filed on October 9, 2020, by the relator in *United States ex rel. Bicocca v. Permanente Medical Group, Inc.*, No. 3:21-cv-03124-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- h. the Complaint filed on October 22, 2014, by the relator in *United States ex rel. Taylor v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- i. the First Amended Complaint filed on November 3, 2014, by the relator in *United States ex rel. Taylor v. Kaiser Permanente*, No. 3:21-cv-03894-EMC (N.D. Cal.);
- j. the United States' Motion to Consolidate Cases filed on June 11, 2021;

k. the Order Granting the United States' Motion to Consolidate Cases filed on June 25, 2021;

l. the United States' Notice of Election to Intervene in Part and to Decline to Intervene in Part filed on July 27, 2021; and

m. this Order.

2. The seal is lifted as to all matters occurring in these consolidated actions after the date of this Order.

3. The United States shall promptly serve Defendants with a copy of this Order and the United States' Notice of Election to Intervene in Part and to Decline to Intervene in Part, and shall serve defendants Kaiser Permanente; Kaiser Foundation Health Plan, Inc.; Kaiser Foundation Health Plan of Colorado; The Permanente Medical Group, Inc.; Southern California Permanente Medical Group, Inc.; and Colorado Permanente Medical Group, P.C., as well as any other newly named defendants, with the United States' complaint by October 25, 2021, in accordance with Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 4(m).

4. Counsel for the United States shall file a notice of appearance in this action, if they have not already done so, for the purpose of receiving ECF notifications of all pleadings and motions filed in this action, as provided for in 31 U.S.C. § 3730(c)(3). The United States may order any deposition transcripts and is entitled to intervene in the portion of these actions in which it is declining to intervene today, for good cause, at any time.

5. Should either a relator or a defendant propose that the portion of these actions in which the United States has not intervened be dismissed, settled, or otherwise discontinued, the Court will provide the United States with notice and an opportunity to be heard before ruling or granting its approval, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 3730(b)(1).

6. The initial case management conference in these consolidated actions shall be held on \_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_:\_\_\_\_ [in Courtroom 5, 17th Floor] [by Zoom webinar.] The parties shall file a joint case management statement no later than seven days before the conference.



1 IT IS SO ORDERED

2  
3 DATED: July \_\_, 2021

4  
5 HON. EDWARD M. CHEN  
6 United States District Judge  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that he is an employee of the Office of the United States Attorney for the Northern District of California and is a person of such age and discretion to be competent to serve papers. The undersigned further certifies that he is causing a copy of:

**UNITED STATES' NOTICE OF ELECTION TO INTERVENE IN PART AND TO DECLINE TO INTERVENE IN PART; [PROPOSED] ORDER TO UNSEAL**

**FILED UNDER SEAL**

to be served this date upon the parties as follows:

Counsel for Relator Osinek

GIBBS LAW GROUP LLP  
Eric Gibbs  
Dylan Hughes  
Amy Zeman  
505 14th Street, Suite 1110  
Oakland, CA 94612  
[ehg@classlawgroup.com](mailto:ehg@classlawgroup.com)  
[dsh@classlawgroup.com](mailto:dsh@classlawgroup.com)  
[amz@classlawgroup.com](mailto:amz@classlawgroup.com)

Counsel for the Arefi Relators

NELSON HARDIMAN, LLP  
Mark S. Hardiman  
Salvatore Zimmitti  
100 Glendon Ave, 14th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90024  
[mhardiman@nelsonhardiman.com](mailto:mhardiman@nelsonhardiman.com)  
[szimmitti@nelsonhardiman.com](mailto:szimmitti@nelsonhardiman.com)

Counsel for the Stein Relators

THE HANAGAMI LAW FIRM, APC  
William K. Hanagami  
5950 Canoga Avenue, Suite 130  
Woodland Hills, CA 91367  
[billhanagami@esquire.la](mailto:billhanagami@esquire.la)

Counsel for the Bryant Relators

GOLDBERG KOHN  
Roger A. Lewis  
55 East Monroe Street, Suite 3300  
Chicago, IL 60603-5792  
[roger.lewis@goldbergkohn.com](mailto:roger.lewis@goldbergkohn.com)

1 Counsel for Relator Bicocca

2 ALEXANDER MORRISON + FEHR, LLP  
3 J. Bernard Alexander III  
4 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 900  
5 Los Angeles, CA 90067  
6 [balexander@amfllp.com](mailto:balexander@amfllp.com)

7 THE EMPLOYMENT LAW GROUP, P.C.  
8 R. Scott Oswald  
9 Janel Quinn  
10 1717 K Street NW, Suite 1110  
11 Washington, DC 20006  
12 [soswald@employmentlawgroup.com](mailto:soswald@employmentlawgroup.com)  
13 [jquinn@employmentlawgroup.com](mailto:jquinn@employmentlawgroup.com)

14 Counsel for Relator Taylor

15 LOEVY & LOEVY  
16 Daniel Moore Twetten  
17 2060 Broadway Street, Suite 460  
18 Boulder, CO 80302  
19 [dan@loevy.com](mailto:dan@loevy.com)

20 CONSTANTINE CANNON LLP  
21 Jessica Tien-Lai Moore  
22 Michael James Ronickher  
23 Ronny Valdes  
24 Max Voldman  
25 1001 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, Suite 1300N  
26 Washington, DC 20004  
27 [jmoore@constantinecannon.com](mailto:jmoore@constantinecannon.com)  
28 [mronickher@constantinecannon.com](mailto:mronickher@constantinecannon.com)  
[rvaldes@constantinecannon.com](mailto:rvaldes@constantinecannon.com)  
[miboldman@constantinecannon.com](mailto:miboldman@constantinecannon.com)

Counsel for the State of California

CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE  
Deputy Attorney General John P. Fisher  
1615 Murray Canyon Frazee Road, Suite 700  
San Diego, CA 92108  
[john.fisher@doj.ca.gov](mailto:john.fisher@doj.ca.gov)

Deputy Attorney General Kevin Davis  
2329 Gateway Oaks Drive, Suite 200  
Sacramento, CA 95833  
[kevin.davis@doj.ca.gov](mailto:kevin.davis@doj.ca.gov)

1 \_\_\_\_\_ BY FIRST CLASS MAIL, by placing such envelope(s) with postage thereon fully prepaid in the  
2 designated area for outgoing U.S. mail in accordance with this office's practice.

3 \_\_\_\_\_ BY PERSONAL SERVICE, (MESSENGER)

4 \_\_\_\_\_ BY FEDERAL EXPRESS

5 \_\_\_\_\_ BY FACSIMILE, (FAX) Telephone No.:

6 ☒ BY EMAIL: I caused each such document to be sent by email to the person or offices of each  
address above.

7 \_\_\_\_\_ BY CERTIFIED MAIL, by placing such envelope(s) with postage thereon fully prepaid in the  
8 designated area for outgoing U.S. mail in accordance with this office's practice.

9 I declare under penalty of perjury, under the laws of the United States, that the foregoing is true  
10 and correct.

11 DATED: July 27, 2021

/s/ Benjamin J. Wolinsky  
BENJAMIN J. WOLINSKY  
Assistant United States Attorney